

Reviews

Shackel, P.A. *Personal Discipline and Material Culture: An Archaeology of Annapolis, Maryland, 1695–1870*. The University of Tennessee Press, Knoxville, 1993; pp xiv, 225, ISBN 0-87049-784-7.

Shackel's work begins with a bold aim: to show how historical archaeology can make a contribution to the emerging field of historical anthropology by using archaeology to illuminate the roots of modern ideologies – to identify the historical relations between groups and understand how modern ideologies emerge and are maintained. He uses Foucault's concept of discipline to look at the change to capitalism (western society) and the creation of standardised disciplines in the Chesapeake Bay area of the U.S.A. Using data on artefacts and goods Shackel focuses on the role they played in the creation of identity in eighteenth-century Annapolis and the adoption of standardised behaviour and mass-produced goods as a way of establishing and reinforcing relationships between groups of people.

Underpinning Shackel's analysis is his belief in the role of material culture in creating social change and establishing and maintaining social boundaries. Material culture is not a mute agent acquired as part of living. Goods, he argues, give meaning to social behaviour as they can have an ideological and social meaning which can be used to create and maintain social distance and social cohesion. The usual suspects, Bourdieu, Foucault, Shanks and Tilley, Hodder, Douglas and Isherwood, Daniel Miller and even Althusser are cited in support of his view.

This book is not the usual archaeological text on a particular site. You will learn little about the sieve size used in Annapolis from this work. It is more akin to the recent synthesis of archaeological work such as Noel-Hume's book on Martins Hundred and Deetz's on Flowerdew Hundred. But where it differs from both these works is in its pursuit of a particular research issue through a number of historical contexts. Shackel has used Braudel's concepts of varying scales of history for his analysis of the development of a new discipline. Thus he looks at the scale of individual time, social time and long term history and the book is divided accordingly.

Individual time

To understand the level of individual time Shackel chooses to analyse material culture from four sites at Annapolis; the Thomas Hyde House, Jonas Green Print Shop, the Victualing Warehouse and the Reynolds Tavern. At the risk of sounding unpost-processual and discussing evidence (with all that term implies about facts) Shackel rather leaves the questions of stratigraphy, site interpretation, historical evidence of social status and the vexed questions of site taphonomy for the reader to discover via the references to various unpublished site reports. However, it is important to his argument and to our evaluation of it that we know that recovered artefacts have a similar depositional context and really do come from the families they are ascribed to. I don't think this is adequately described in the text although Shackel outlines these issues and is clearly aware of them.

Shackel first uses a simple analysis of ceramics to measure the degree of penetration of 'the new segmenting behaviour'. Ceramics are categorised into types (by which he seems to mean fabric or body of the ceramic), shapes and sizes and recorded on a presence/absence basis. The relative proportions of each reflects the penetration of the new behaviour. For example an assemblage with few types and sizes indicates

non-participation whereas one with few types but many sizes indicates a high acceptance of standardising behaviour. The analysis does show a broad trend in which the ceramic data indicates that segmentation and discipline at the table appears among the elite in the mid-1700s but by the turn of the century had been adopted by all the 'middle class' groups measured. Large scale consumption of matched table sets begins only in the mid-1800s. This evidence allows Shackel to expound the trickle-down argument of the development of capitalist behaviour.

Shackel then turns to tooth brushes, the adoption of which indicates the rise of care of the body – a capitalist behaviour. The standardisation of tooth brush manufacture also indicates the rise of capitalist work practices. Shackel measured the degree of standardisation of tooth brush manufacture by measuring the distance between holes (for the brush bit) and calculating deviations from the mean distance in thousands of an inch (none of the SI for Shackel!). The earlier brushes do have a higher variability although there is a limited sample size. I would have been happier if Shackel had perhaps included a modern tooth brush as a control. Shackel concludes this analysis by noting that as tooth brush manufacture became more standardised the cost decreased allowing their accessibility to the broader population.

Whatever the merits of Shackel's conclusions, the simple analysis he undertakes demonstrates how a study of material culture items can actually address research issues rather than merely provide summary statistics of extensively catalogued items.

Social time

In dealing with the scale of social time Shackel moves seamlessly into the use of historical documents to look at the introduction of the new form of discipline through the introduction and use of material goods and their social context. The focus of analysis moves to the geographical level of the Chesapeake and Annapolis rather than the four archaeological sites.

Shackel first outlines a social history which he claims demonstrates how the gentry codified their position in society by legal means and then by adherence to new standards of etiquette. Shackel points to the introduction of racial legislation and legislation to regulate trade in the period of the 1710s to the 1720s and then the emergence of the gentry from the 1740s, which climaxed in the 1760s with the construction of a number of Georgian mansions. But the argument is asserted, not demonstrated and no other explanations are evaluated.

This provides the context for Shackel's analysis of probate data (a luxury seemingly missing from Australia). By looking at the presence or absence of key material culture indicators of the new discipline such as clocks, scientific instruments, forks, napkins, tea sets and so on, the adoption and penetration of the new discipline can be traced. In particular, as probate data gives estate values the inventories can be analysed according to economic position (of course social status can be independent of wealth).

His results revealed a growth of items reflecting the new discipline in Annapolis during the decades of the 1710s and the 1720s. This levels off and then increases from the 1750s through to the 1770s. This pattern, however, is virtually non-existent in the non-urban area although there is a general trend towards increasing consumption over time.

Long term history

To understand long term trends Shackel uses the long term history of etiquette as descriptions of ideal behaviour in order to interpret material culture. Shackel points out that the main trend in human behaviour from the Renaissance onwards is for human behaviour to become more exactly and precisely measured. This measurement is obviously expressed in the creation of measured time. As well, etiquette is another form where human behaviour is measured and segmented. Shackel argues that the development and changing of the rules of etiquette moved from communal behaviour to rules that supported precise, standardised, segmenting behaviour in most aspects of life.

The relevance of Shackel's work to the study of Australian history is immediate. The question of 'How do peoples' habits and lifestyle change from the essentially pre-industrial 1790s to the more modern industrial society of the turn of the century?' was raised as one of the five research questions for the excavations at Cumberland Street in the Rocks and follows on from the work of Grace Karskens. Away from the Rocks and early Sydney, archaeologists have yet to consider the changes in capitalist society with the rise and decline of 'high Victorian' culture as well as the development of a distinctive Australian culture towards the end of the nineteenth century. Shackel's approach could be usefully adopted to further the understanding of these issues. That Shackel's work ultimately derives from a public archaeology project, Archaeology in Annapolis, surely must inspire consultant archaeologists.

However this is not to say Shackel's work is beyond criticism. Overall the argument he puts is a bit too cosy. Like an express train, capitalism and the new segmenting behaviour seems to have rolled on having got 'line clear' at the start of the eighteenth century and kept going. Much of the text seems to take the progression for granted with Shackel illuminating the details. No other alternatives are explored and the detail of the argument is sometimes only vaguely supported. But one thing that historical archaeologists have shown is that often at the individual level things are not cut and dried. There may be variation, resistance to change, alternatives may be pursued but Shackel's analysis with its focus on power does not cover these aspects.

Shackel does not explore in detail the models he is using, particularly not Braudel's scales of history. While his analysis of individual time and of the long term seem to work, the points made about social time seem to me to fit into either of the other levels, leaving the analysis of structures and the social level unexplored. Social structures such as the church and government as well as economic structure could have been examined in more detail as well as the 'Tuesday Club'. These could have been examined at all levels of society to see how they created and reinforced the new discipline.

The book seems to be poorly organised with sections of Shackel's argument on the role of material culture scattered seemingly at random in the text. This may be an intentional post-processual move or it may be poor editing. No doubt it also reflects the usual problems of having to change a thesis into something readable and commercial.

Overall *Personal Discipline and Material Culture* is well worth reading for its attempt to move historical archaeology beyond the laundry lists and catalogues to dealing with interesting problems.

Iain Stuart
Archaeology
University of Sydney

Christopher Breward, *The Culture of Fashion: A New History of Fashionable Dress*, Studies in Design and Material Culture series, Manchester University Press, Manchester, 1995; pp. 244. illustrations. ISBN 0 7190 4124 4 Hardback. 0 7190 4125 2 Paperback.

This book is an extraordinary history of fashion and society. It is a chronological account of changes in fashion in the last 600 years, in the context of 'class, gender, economic and symbolic meanings' which analyses the reasons for changes in style and describes popular culture of the time as well as politics. The author 'aimed to incorporate ... art historical, design historical and cultural elements' and writes that his main purpose was to broaden the parameters of fashion history by engaging with other disciplines. Clothes 'fulfil the relatively straightforward function of providing the body with a protective layer'. Fashion, however, has the ability to communicate an extraordinary range of information: 'educational background, political allegiance, religion, sexual preference, sporting interests, and, perhaps most emphatically, class background'.

The main area discussed is England but fashions of twentieth-century America and Europe are also mentioned. Only eight pages of the illustrations are in colour and they are all together toward the end of the book, almost as an afterthought. Source materials include paintings and sculptures, book illustrations, tapestries and stained glass, as well as many literary sources, both primary and secondary. The author claims he conscientiously took into account the biases of these sources, which are supplemented by the scant archaeological material available. The seven chapters divide fashion history from the medieval through the renaissance, the seventeenth, eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, with the twentieth divided into two.

Fashions of wealthy and aristocratic people are described in detail, as are – as far as possible – the clothes of lesser folk. At the beginning of the fourteenth century 'simplicity and looseness typify the appearance of all classes and both sexes... costume form for men and women were based on a simple "T" shaped shift with cylindrical sleeves'. Later in the century a tighter shape that gave women a more feminine figure made necessary the use of buttons and a different technique in cutting the fabric. Sumptuary laws of 1365 tried to dictate what sort of clothes servants and others than aristocrats were allowed to wear. The law also prescribed colours and materials for different strata of society. Until these laws came into force, medieval costume was not conveniently put into compartments according to social status, as some histories would have us believe.

During the Renaissance, fashions became more distinctive. Both male and female clothes were exaggerated to an almost theatrical degree, especially for young aristocrats. In the Elizabethan age, in spite of the strong-minded female monarch, women were mainly valued for their appearance. From the various quotations used in this chapter it seems that women generally were thought vain and superficial. There is an enlightening section on symbolism and the use of emblems in the sixteenth century. Misogyny continued into the seventeenth century, when both male and female fashions tended to become elongated, and much embellished. The cut was more restrained, but the style was still as flamboyant and ostentatious as in the sixteenth century. This applied to a small elite section of society only.

At the beginning of the seventeenth century cross-dressing became fashionable, as is apparent both from a number of documents, such as pamphlets on hermaphroditism, and from the androgynous fashions of this time. The printing of pamphlets extended to early fashion plates. These forerunners of fashion magazines published well-liked romantic and

popular stories as well. Toward the end of the century a relaxed, more sober and less exuberant style became apparent. In this chapter there is hardly a hint of how the lower classes dressed, even though it mentions that the merchant classes were dressed in a formal and sober manner.

Early eighteenth-century journals were produced specially with 'elite' women in mind, with a 'mix of satire, gossip, short stories, reviews and most importantly full page engravings of fashionable men, women and children, in poses chosen to illustrate the finer points of postural etiquette and seasonal changes'. Almanacs and periodicals too showed new consumers what to buy. This was the time of the early Industrial Revolution and production and marketing techniques developed and changed accordingly. These changes reached all strata of society in a short space of time, so that now farmers' wives dressed like 'ladies of quality' when they could afford it. The production of mainly cotton in the newly built Lancashire mills also made a difference to fashion styles. In the second half of the century oriental influences can be traced, and simpler, more comfortable styles for women. For men a kind of uniform became fashionable of cream or buff coloured breeches, with short waistcoats. Wigs lost their importance in fashionable dressing.

In the next chapter the author argues that the 'nineteenth century style change, whilst in part resulting from new technologies and a sense of the modern, was also the product of shifting cultural and social attitudes'. The rapid changes in consumption brought about equally rapid changes in both female and male fashions, the classical line of the early century giving way to a more restrictive style for women with a tight waist and crinoline, which by the end of the century changed into the simpler 'bohemian' reform dress, and a female version of the tailored men's suit. Men wore well-tailored suits in tasteful if dull colours with top hats that lent the second half of the century a certain romanticism. The period was characterised by energy and expansion, a 'preoccupation with mythical past values and moral certainties' which gave it an air of contradiction.

The mass consumption of the early twentieth century followed. 'This is primarily a book about history' the author claims 'and it is perhaps difficult to place contemporary fashion under the same kind of "objective" scrutiny as the clothing of the more distant past.' Styles changed even faster, with the seasonal showings of couturier and ready-to-wear collections. Breward says that although he categorised fashion into time slots, fashion could not be categorised successfully in this way. This becomes apparent in the twentieth century when for example the 'twenties' style only began in 1926 and then took some years to become popular. The choice of illustrations is intriguing, as the images do not always represent the 'typical' fashions of that era, as the informed reader may expect. The story takes the reader up to the end of the 1980s and gives an account of designs of most well-known couturiers.

The use of long sentences and an irritating use of neologisms such as 'prioritised', 'literalness' or 'decadism' (for periods of ten years) made the book heavy reading. In some places the description of the costumes is somewhat confusing, but that can be attributed to the confusing messages fashion sometimes sends. A good glossary of terms would have been useful. Nevertheless, having been interested in fashion one way or another for a long time, I found this work gives a fascinating insight into ways fashionable styles developed and though it is not easily read from cover to cover, it is an invaluable reference.

*Eve Stenning
Sydney*

P. Kostoglou and J. McCarthy, compiled by J. Paay, *Whaling and Sealing in South Australia, Australian Institute for Maritime Archaeology, Special Publication No 6, 1991; pp. xi, 77, 94 figures. ISBN 0810-6991.*

The coast and off-shore islands of what was to become South Australia were worked by whalers and sealers well before the establishment of that colony in 1837. For a few years after that event serious attempts were made to develop these activities more efficiently, a number of bay (i.e. shore-based) whaling sites being occupied. By the 1850s, however, it was generally recognised that such efforts were unprofitable and the industry ceased.

In 1984-85 the South Australian government conducted an investigation to determine what physical evidence, if any, of the industry had survived and what conservation procedures should be followed. After the identification through documentary sources of the general location of past whaling and sealing sites a field survey was conducted. This publication is a report on that survey, which covered eighteen whaling and seven sealing stations. Of these twenty five sites, eighteen could either not be accurately located on the ground or had not left any visible evidence of their earlier use. Only three sites had both documentary and physical evidence confirming their existence.

The reports on each site vary considerably in length and detail. Both bay whaling and sealing required no great capital investment and at times the occupation of a chosen site was quite brief. Both these factors help to explain the lack of any significant physical evidence on many sites.

The work consists of four chapters. The first deals with the historical background of the industry in the region, from the early deep-sea whaling at the end of the eighteenth century to the collapse of the shore-based activities in the 1850s. It concludes with four recommendations concerning the registration of State Heritage items, survey and recording programmes, excavations and site inspections. The second and third chapters contain reports on the whaling and sealing sites respectively and a brief fourth chapter discusses the shipping associated with the industry. Four appendices complete the report.

A precise format is employed in the chapters concerned with the individual sites. In both cases the sites are taken in order from west to east, as shown on two maps of the entire coast, to be found in the appendices. Under the individual site heading a location map is given, followed by a brief history of the activity on that site, a description of it, where possible, an account of the artefacts recovered, if any, and a final general summary. Photographs and diagrams illustrate the text in most instances. Keeping in mind that this is a report made in response to a specific request, the format is satisfactory, giving quick access to particular information.

As noted above the reports vary from brief speculative comments, where little real evidence is available, to several pages of detailed description and discussion of those areas where documentary records, site remains and artefacts are all available. The reports make little reference to the actual investigative techniques employed although in one of them we are told 'both visual and remote sensing techniques' were used, the latter being a reference to metal detector and magnetometer passes over the ground.

The fourth chapter, though limited to a page, has useful information about the shipping employed, including both deep sea and coastal vessels. The latter category includes the many small craft used to transport the products of the industry from remote sites to ports from which they could be exported overseas. The chapter concludes with a list of five vessels of

special interest whose wreck sites on the coast have not been excavated. These and other such wreck sites are also set out in tabular form in an appendix.

The entire work is a useful working report, logically constructed for easy reference and very well illustrated with photos, maps and diagrams. In this well produced publication there appears to be only one clerical error: on page 69 a map of all the whaling sites does not show a position for Coffin Bay although it appears in the accompanying legend.

John Bach
Coal Point, NSW

B. Rogers, *Nineteenth Century Salt Manufacturing Sites in Tasmania, Working Paper No. 11, University of Wollongong Science and Technology Analysis Research Programme in association with The Australian Society for Historical Archaeology, 1993. ISBN 0864182538.*

This report aims to provide a reference to information about the nineteenth century salt manufacturing industry in Tasmania. It is structured in five chapters: Chapter 1 provides background information about the industry, Chapters 2 to 4 discuss the various sites where salt works are known or suspected to have been located (grouped geographically rather than chronologically), and Chapter 5 offers some general findings and proposes some excavation work which the author believes could provide useful new data with limited effort. Appendices provide some official statistics on the dates of operation and location of salt works, salt prices, convict workers at the well-documented but unlocated Port Arthur salt works, and a 1987 report on an alternative site for the Bruny Island salt and soap works discussed in detail in Chapter 2. An extensive bibliography is also included.

Chapter 1 sets the industry in historical and geographical perspective, gives an overview of the sites discussed further in Chapters 2 to 4, and provides very useful information for readers with no knowledge of salt production on the various salt making processes that were in use. Chapter 2 discusses the four southern sites: Bruny Island, Pitt Water, North West Bay and Port Arthur. Bruny Island and Pitt Water are covered in some depth since considerable work has been undertaken there, but the North West Bay and Port Arthur sites have not yet been located, and are only known from historical records. Chapter 3 presents what is known about harvesting salt from the lagoons of the Salt Pan Plains, and evidence for two possible sites in the Tamar Valley, Whirlpool Reach near Deviot, and a site in the George Town district. Chapter 4 is devoted to James Radcliff's Lisdillon salt works on the east coast, where the excavations are well known to the author. The treatment of the different sites is of necessity very uneven. I found the Lisdillon site the most interesting (as, perhaps, did the author).

While the quality of this publication is generally very high, there is a factual error on page 3 (10 shillings per hundredweight is just over 1 penny per pound, not just under), and it is hard to see the usefulness of Table 2 on page 4, either in this report or in the publication it came from (Hartwell, R. M. 1954, *The economic development of Van Diemen's Land*, Melbourne University Press: 191).

Much effort has been devoted by the author to tracing information back to original sources, and evaluating its worth. The reasoning behind these evaluations is also presented, allowing readers scope for making their own judgements. Most of the people mentioned were placed in their historical context, although I was unable to uncover who was the Parker of Parker's Papers in the University of Tasmania Archives.

This report is well presented and very easy to read, holding the interest of a reviewer with no background in either Tasmanian history or salt manufacturing. It more than meets its aim to provide a historical overview of salt manufacturing in Tasmania, and hopefully will stimulate further work in this area.

Sally Rice
School of Computer and Information Science
University of South Australia

Stephen Webb, *Palaeopathology of Aboriginal Australians: Health and Disease Across a Hunter-Gatherer Continent.* Cambridge University Press, 1995; pp.xii,324, \$75.00, ISBN 0 521 46044 1 Hardback.

Steve Webb's primary concern in this book is the nature and history of diseases in particular regions of Australia from initial Aboriginal colonisation, more than 60 000 years ago. 'The main aim ... has been to study a selection of pathologies in order to provide some measure of the health status of Late Holocene Aboriginal Peoples living in different parts of the continent' (p.7). Webb rightly argues that the history of diseases is critical for understanding current health problems in Australia and, more generally, the ecology of our human species. The concluding remark (p.293) that Aboriginal health was very good anywhere on the Australian continent belies a wealth of exciting research with remarkable consequences for understanding archaeological evidence, both prehistoric and historic.

Human skeletal remains provide the main source of evidence used and they include bones from archaeological collections (Broadbeach, Kow Swamp and Roonka). The oldest bones come from the Willandra Lakes Hominid (WLH) series which span approximately 14 000 to 40 000 years ago. Most bones are much more recent in age and come from several early museum collections with less reliable locational information. Community outrage surrounding some of these early museum collections has resulted in legislative and other support to have many of the remains reburied. These issues are touched on by Webb, but are dealt with in more detail elsewhere.

Many skeletons are incomplete and it is difficult to identify the size of particular collections or the actual number of individuals (given as 4 500 on the dust jacket). In any case, limitations of space would preclude bone by bone listing of the data, better presented on compact disc. However, this presents no problem for the analyses and Webb provides here summary data from 1 582 cranial bones and 6 622 post-cranial bones from six areas, spanning Australia, though focussing on the southeast. The unevenness of the database requires a somewhat irregular chapter outline which singles out the early skeletal material for special treatment.

After introduction, some historical background to Australian palaeopathology and two chapters on the Pleistocene and early Holocene, the subsequent chapters analyse the collections of more recent age, and these are organised by pathology. Chapter 5 is on stress (cribra orbitalia, dental enamel hypoplasia and Harris lines). Chapter 6 is on infectious diseases (non-specific infection including osteomyelitis, treponemal infection including yaws, endemic treponarid and syphilis and tibial bowing). Chapter 7 is on osteoarthritis. Chapter 8 is on trauma (cranial and postcranial) and surgery (trephination and amputation). Chapter 9 is on neoplastic diseases (cancer) including multiple myeloma, metastatic carcinoma, naso-pharyngeal carcinoma, osteomas and exostoses. Chapter 10 is on congenital malformations (spina bifida, meningocele, cleft palate, scaphocephaly/

craniosynostosis). Chapter 11 is a case study from Motupore (excavated by Jim Allen), an island off the south coast of PNG with archaeological evidence of trading networks. Human bones from this site provide a basis for contrasts with Australian material which has much less evidence of infectious diseases.

Chapter 12 analyses the evidence presented in earlier chapters to compare and contrast the limited Pleistocene material and the Holocene by region. Of particular interest is Webb's argument linking health and disease with subsistence, social organisation and environmental zones to provide a basis for the development of particular adaptations emergent in the Pleistocene. There is some independent support also for Late Holocene intensification and sedentism as formulated by Harry Lourandos for southwestern Victoria.

A model is proposed to explain the extraordinary levels of stress and other diseases in the central Murray, suggesting levels of population, economic intensification and sedentism not normally associated with Aboriginal people. While the gist of these arguments has been previously outlined by Webb and others, the palaeopathological evidence has not been so thoroughly presented. The distinctiveness of Aboriginal cultures in the Murray valley has now been documented from various independent data sets, including lithics, burial practices, subsistence, physique as well as health and disease. That such differences can be documented archaeologically suggests that diversity in Aboriginal cultures past and present is much greater than could ever have been predicted by ethnography alone. It is intriguing that the distinctiveness of the Murray Aboriginal cultures can be traced to the earliest evidence available, an issue also addressed by Colin Pardoe.

As the book unfolds into a focussed argument about the Central Murray Aboriginal populations, it might be easy to overlook some of the fascinating and more idiosyncratic forensic discoveries. Incidence of cribra stress suggests that central Murray Aboriginal men had better access to nutritious diets (p.104) than women, telling us something about gender. Forms of stress like dental enamel hypoplasia (p.110) and Harris lines (p.124), and arthritis in particular joints (pp.173–6) can indicate regional differences in diet, sedentism and dependence on agriculture. Tooth wear patterns suggest ground seeds in the diets of Willandra Lakes people 28 000–32 000 years ago (p.60; and also documented for this time period in recent evidence from Cuddie Springs, presented in Judith Furby's 1995 PhD thesis, UNSW). There is also the suggestion of spear thrower use at 28 000–32 000 through study of osteoarthritis (p.47). Trachoma eye infection was present in the terminal Pleistocene. While some of the diagnoses are a little less than certain and sometimes not independent of contextual archaeological data, the list of potential applications to archaeological problems is remarkably long.

Although Webb writes clearly and logically, explaining medical conditions as he goes, the sheer number of relatively uncommon terms really demands a glossary which would have helped an archaeologist like me, with little medical background. The typographic errors are few and minor (e.g. '38587' should read '38586', pp. 82–4). The illustrations are superb (with acknowledgements to Dragi Markovic), and Webb should be thanked for successfully bridging disciplines of archaeology, pathology and forensic science to produce a fascinating textbook, surveying Aboriginal palaeopathology in Australia.

Richard Fullagar
Division of Anthropology
Australian Museum

C. Hastorf, *Agriculture and the Onset of Political Inequality before the Inka*, New Studies in Archaeology, Cambridge University Press, 1993; pp.xv, 298, illustrations, \$155. ISBN 0 521 40272 7. Hardback.

This volume ambitiously aims to explain the prehistoric emergence of political and economic inequality. Its setting is a 25 kilometre by 43 kilometre area in Central Peru, from about AD 200 until the arrival of the Inka state in the fifteenth century. Its focus is the often overshadowed half millennium following the decline of Wari influence (the 'Late Intermediate Period' or LIP). The archaeological information employed is impressive, from settlement survey to numerous excavations and analyses of cultural materials and food remains. It derives from the Upper Mantaro Archaeological Research Project, in which agricultural ecology, prehistoric field systems and plant remains were Hastorf's specialty. The array of data assists her rejection of univariate causal explanations for the onset of political change, and the simplistic positing of parallel change across political, economic and social life. The integration of so many threads is thought-provoking but there are some tenuous links. For example, Andean agriculture, cultural ecology and principles of socio-religious organization are reviewed ethnologically but with little recourse to historical sources. In seeking conditions for change, attention is given to 'local cultural principles' like dual social organization and redistributive feasting. Their articulation with the model for the onset of inequality is generally limited, and a tendency to assume these phenomena to be encounter-period relics from ca. AD 200 underestimates their propensity to evolve.

Tinku (ritual confrontation and dispute resolution) and *ch'axwa* (fierce war) are, however, crucial concepts in the interplay of conflict and consensus which is regarded as a key nexus in political change. Fragmentation and the building of local alliances and identities have long been almost definitional characteristics of the LIP. This relies on documentary modelling, although the use of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century sources deserves more sophisticated treatment than it receives. In what ways, for example, is the work of Guaman Poma (ca.1613) pertinent to post-Wari/Tiwanaku intergroup tensions in the Andes? Chapter 5 introduces documentary information 'which specifically pertains to the period prior to the Inka invasion'. The principal evidence is that given by Junin residents, who were up to 94 years old, to the Toledan inspection (*visita*) in 1570. Their responses cement an image of pre-Inka Sausa people under the localized leadership of *sinchikuna* (war leaders) and in frequent conflict. The witnesses were not adults when the Inka came and their traditions were also transmitted through *visitas* which aimed to justify the Spanish invasion by, for example, demonstrating Inka tyranny and the ungoverned (uncivilized) state of local populations. Do we risk rediscovering dubious Inka imperial and colonial historiographic caricatures?

The argument is that a power vacuum was created when Wari influence waned. Yet, there is no evidence of Wari architecture or ceramics in the study area. Admittedly, Wari influences may simply lack material visibility. The second step, in Wanka I times (the early LIP, dated to ca. AD 1012–1163), was a move from lower valleys and their margins to 'increasingly defended site locations', mainly low ridges and slopes beside valley floors. The population is calculated to have risen from 8 600 to 22 000. The relocation is thought to represent negotiation of power, conflict and new alliances of clustered settlements. The Wanka II pattern (dated to ca. AD 1285–1474, with a population estimated at 32 000) is seen to reflect rising tensions by the abandonment of many settlements and lands in the eastern area, and aggregation focussed on large upland 'knoll-top walled settlements' in the western part

of the study region. The third step is that, once the move occurred, nearby lands were more intensively used (terracing schemes).

Two postulated centres of alliances, at Hatunmarca and Tunánmarca, oddly emerged on adjacent hills within five kilometres of each other. Their allied areas are partly determined from the distribution frequencies of pottery types at northern and southern sites, the exclusive northern distribution of particular blade cores, and the distinct character of Inka impact in each area. Material culture distributions need not imply political affiliations, although they are argued to do so here. The archaeological information on inequality of wealth within Wanka II sites is interesting, although its linkage to inequality in the distribution of political authority is less apparent.

The western clustering of large Wanka II settlements, and a population increase from 2 000 to ca. 10 000 people, are argued to have required new socio-economic structures. Hastoff emphasizes that power struggles initiated the relocation. The suggestion of eastern land abandonment in Wanka II need not be the necessary conclusion from settlement relocation. In some instances the author refers to the 'virtual inaccessibility' of valley lands at this time (p.205). Some uncertainty remains here, since the 'abandonment' is made subject to the possibility of commuting by farmers and other access systems (pp. 149 and 196). There is even the possibility of 'field houses' remaining in the east (p.65). To be convincing, the inference of an exclusively conflict-driven settlement change requires demonstration within a comprehensively modelled cultural and subsistence system. This has wider import, since similar patterns are identified elsewhere (eg. around Lake Titicaca), and dissimilar ones near the Inka capital. That regional variation is the thematic focus of D'Altroy's *Provincial Power in the Inka Empire*, which is also based on Upper Mantaro archaeology.

The study region spans several environments and landuse zones, at altitudes between 3380 metres and 4100 metres. Regional environmental diversity may have facilitated village access to further production zones. Given camelid remains from excavations and the environment's high altitude, the omission of pastoralism from this framework is disappointing. Contradictions confuse assessment of the role of camelid meat. Did its consumption double between Wanka I and Wanka II deposits (as per p.66) or was there no significant increase in camelid bone, despite the shift closer to pastures (p.180)? Camelids provide wool (useful in the cooling palaeoclimate around AD 1300) and transport for produce (relevant to the configuration of dispersed fields and a central village). Pastures are similarly excluded from the hypothetical 'landuse catchment territories' of sites. Hastoff's own evidence of valley crops (maize and legumes) and distant lowland products (coca and certain woods) in Wanka II sites (p.176) reflects the limitations of local-subsistence modelling in the Andean context, whether extended by exchange or discontinuous territoriality.

Hastoff commendably crosses period-boundaries and does develop an explanatory framework for late prehistoric Andean social processes. However, like Conrad and Demarest's *Religion and Empire*, the work emphasizes particular historical images of Andean society which may not merit over-generalization. Archaeological models will undoubtedly revisit these images as further detailed regional studies of this breadth emerge. Unfortunately, the text contains some difficult sentence constructions, repetitions and spelling errors which should have been eliminated in a book at this price.

Ken Heffernan
Archaeology and Anthropology
Australian National University

Jacobs, Jane M. and Fay Gale, 1994. *Tourism and the Protection of Aboriginal Cultural Sites*. Australian Heritage Commission. Special Australian Heritage Publication Series Number 10. Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra. ISBN 0814-8171. Pp. xii + 146. 43 Plates, 2 Figures. Paperback.

According to Jane Jacobs and Fay Gale the worst kinds of visitors to Aboriginal rock art sites in Kakadu National Park and at Uluru are unruly school children, large organised tour groups from interstate, locals and ill-educated tour guides. The authors frequently observed such visitors damaging the art by touching, ignoring signs and barriers, trampling vegetation (which stirs up dust) and even committing vandalism. Eavesdropping on guided tours revealed that many visitors were unaware of or even disinterested in the art. In some cases racist tour guides, many of whom were grossly ignorant about the significance of Aboriginal rock art, used visits to Aboriginal sites merely as a backdrop to hold forth with their highly negative and inaccurate stereotypes about Aboriginal people. On the other hand many visitors were very interested in what they saw and wanted to learn more. Smaller tour groups were well-behaved and the guides well-informed. In one survey at Ubirr (Kakadu NP) nearly all visitors enjoyed the art and over 50 percent said it had exceeded their expectations. People frequently speculated openly about the age, authenticity and meaning of the art. In the absence of accurate information motifs were interpreted as ladders, rabbits, teddy bears, Mickey Mouse and spacemen. Overseas and interstate visitors in particular expressed disappointment at the apparently low level of Aboriginal involvement in site management, but where Aboriginal guides were available visitor satisfaction was extremely high.

These are some of the fascinating but perhaps not so surprising results from studies of visitor pressure on Aboriginal rock art sites outlined in Jacob and Gale's new book *Tourism and the Protection of Aboriginal Cultural Sites*. This is an updated and revised version of the 1987 publication *Tourists and the National Estate* by the same authors. The new title more accurately reflects the content of the work, which is primarily about strategies for mitigating the impact of visitors on Aboriginal rock art sites at Kakadu, Uluru and elsewhere. The authors take as their starting point the growth and economic importance of cultural tourism in Australia and the role of site management in ensuring a sustainable tourism industry. Introductory chapters outline the physical effects of visitors on Aboriginal art sites, both obvious and subtle, and describe techniques that can be used for measuring visitor pressure. Most graffiti dates from the period before cameras became common. Today's visitors are usually content to take away photographs rather than sections of art cut from the rock surface, as happened in the past. Such souvenir hunters included scientists and curators who 'conserved' the art by removing it to the safety of their museum collections. Today in situ conservation is paramount and direct Aboriginal involvement in site management and interpretation increasingly common.

As well as presenting results of their own surveys the authors overview and evaluate visitor management strategies operating at Aboriginal rock art sites elsewhere in Australia. Comparisons are made with contemporary heritage site management practices in the UK and Europe. Australia has yet to develop strong formal links with private enterprise in the areas of tourist promotion of heritage places and the manufacture and sale of high quality souvenirs, including postcards and posters, at on-site sales outlets. Elsewhere such cooperation has proven highly beneficial to both the tourism industry and heritage conservation. On the other hand, Australia has yet to adopt the practice of charging entrance fees to almost every heritage site, as happens in Britain. Even

churches are not entirely immune, although fees are usually charged for car-parking rather than entry to the building itself. Overseas practice may be relevant to the management and marketing of some historic heritage sites in Australia. The management of Aboriginal rock art sites presents its own problems. In addition to obvious difficulties raised by the often remote location of many rock art sites, ethical questions arise when tourists wish to photograph art or visit places considered sacred or inappropriate by local Aboriginal owners. Some sites at Uluru have been closed to visitors for such reasons.

Who will find this book useful? It is certainly easy to read, and often interesting, although I found the description of survey techniques and mechanical counting devices a little over-laboured in places. It seems a little obvious (on p.23) that 'if a site can be reached by more than one road it will be necessary to cover all access routes with counters' and that road traffic counters 'are unable to record foot traffic'. The authors state that their book is deliberately practical and prescriptive, but is not intended to be a blueprint for site management. It certainly does not include enough detail for that, nor sufficient direct reference in the text to the numerous detailed studies listed in the extensive bibliography. This book is a good general introductory guide to visitor management at Aboriginal rock art sites, and is likely to be of value to students of heritage conservation and cultural tourism, as well as to anyone with a general interest in the topic (even archaeologists). Despite the claim (p.4) that management procedures and recommendations developed in the book are applicable more generally, and the occasional reference to historic buildings management in Australia and overseas, this book is primarily about Australian Aboriginal rock art sites. However the bibliography includes a wealth of literature on cultural tourism, visitor survey techniques, cultural heritage management (both Aboriginal and non-Aboriginal) and rock art conservation. For this reason alone it should be an invaluable resource for anyone with research or teaching interests in these areas.

*Sarah Colley
Archaeology
University of Sydney*